

Book Reviews

Recensions

The Art of the State, Volume III: Belonging? Diversity, Recognition and Shared Citizenship in Canada

Keith Banting, Thomas J. Courchene and F. Leslie Seidle, Editors
Institute for Research on Public Policy, Montreal, P.Q., 2007

Reviewed by Lois S. Winstock, B.A., LL.B., B.S.W., M.S.W.

The recent release of Volume III of *The Art of the State* series, prepared by the Institute for Research on Public Policy, could not be more timely; as 2007 drew to a close, world attention was focused on Canada, and, more particularly, Toronto, its most multicultural and racially diverse city. It is in this city where a sixteen-year-old girl was murdered by her father, allegedly for refusing to wear a hijab to her public high school. The ensuing discourse swirled around the apparent failure of Canada's much-heralded multicultural and integration policies as evidenced by this tragic event. In the same week, a majority of the Supreme Court of Canada held, in *Bruker v Marcovitz*, that equality rights, more particularly gender equality, enshrined in the *Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms*, 1982 may, in certain circumstances, override the entitlement to religious freedom also guaranteed under the *Charter*. Issues of difference, and the extent to which they are protected and promoted by social institutions in Canada, therefore, remain foremost in the public conscience.

Clearly, a scholarly book that addresses Canada's "multicultural agenda" (which recognizes cultural differences) and its "integration agenda" (which seeks to

bring minorities into the mainstream) is most welcome. *Belonging? Diversity, Recognition and Shared Citizenship in Canada* is a compilation of an extensive introduction, fifteen papers and eight commentaries, and a concluding chapter. It is written by leading researchers and academics, from Canada and elsewhere, who specialize in the areas of social policy, sociology, law, science, geography, education and Islamic studies. The editors, themselves, are highly respected members of the academy and specialists in the fields of public policy (Banting and Seidle) and economics (Courchene). The impressive array of contributors to this volume have compiled an informative and diverse, if sometimes dense, addition to the extant scholarly literature concerned with multiculturalism and minority integration in Canada.

Belonging? Diversity, Recognition and Shared Citizenship in Canada is divided into five sections: Canadian approaches to recognizing and accommodating diversity; international experiences; indigenous peoples; faith-based communities and diversity; and ethnocultural communities: participation and social cohesion. In the final paper, the editors draw upon the previous chapters to provide their own conclusions and discuss a variety of policy instruments that could facilitate integration and strengthen shared citizenship.

Section One begins with a paper by Will Kymlicka that provides the theoretical foundation for the balance of the book. He identifies three diversity models present in Canadian policy and governance structures which he describes as "silos": francophones/Québécois; immigrant/ethnic groups; and Aboriginal people. While distinct, they nevertheless reflect an overriding liberal ideology. For Kymlicka, liberal-democratic institutions and diversity policies are inextricably linked and connected to broader social norms of human rights and liberal constitutionalism. The process of accommodation of difference afforded by diversity policies is, itself, transformative for both dominant and subordinated groups; they must engage in new practices, relationships, and discourses. Kymlicka's conceptualization of multiculturalism within a liberal-democratic framework mandates that those demanding inclusion "must accept the principles of human rights and civil liberties and the procedures of liberal-democratic constitutionalism with their guarantees of gender equality, religious freedom, racial non-discrimination, gay rights and due process" (p. 64). For Kymlicka, a well-functioning liberal democracy will engender allegiance amongst its citizens regardless of their origins. The issue to be addressed is not how to promote shared citizenship, but what factors prevent or weaken social solidarity.

The balance of the first section — indeed, the rest of the book — responds to Kymlicka's thesis. The remaining chapters in the first section draw attention to the disenfranchisement of Canada's ethnic populations. McMurtry discusses the disproportionate levels of poverty experienced by both Aboriginal and immigrant/ethnic communities as well as their inaccessibility to, and unequal treatment by, the justice system. All of these factors erode a sense of shared citizenship.

Similarly, Abu-Laban questions the promotion of illiberal policies and human rights violations by liberal-democratic institutions, as well as the growth of a neo-liberal discourse within Canada that has disengaged the social citizen. Salée examines Québec's record on "diversity management", which, historically, bears the markings of inclusivity and recognition of difference, yet is consumed with a discussion of the presumed qualitative differences between federal and Québec approaches to multiculturalism that mask the inherent ineffectiveness of provincial multicultural policies. In response to Salée, McAndrew posits that the Québécois' ability to respond to the demands of multiculturalism is restricted by their self-identification as a nation oppressed and marginalized by the English majority.

The final two chapters in this section consist of a quantitative study of foreign-born and Aboriginal populations in Canada's largest cities, including an overview of the various policy instruments, programmes and institutions that have been developed to effect "diversity management" and a commentary thereon. The concentration of immigrants in urban centres has resulted in services for these populations being situated there, while the movement of ethno-specific groups to the suburbs leaves them underserved and thereby increases the potential for ethnic and inter-ethnic tensions.

The second section, "Indigenous Peoples", is brief, which is surprising given the importance ascribed to this "silo" by Kymlicka. It consists of four chapters, one of which is concerned with the diversity models employed in New Zealand in response to its Maori population. The most significant point to be drawn from this section comes from Peters' paper, "First Nations and Métis People and Diversity in Canadian Cities." There has been a considerable improvement in the economic and labour force positions of Aboriginal populations in Canadian cities (but not those on reserves), and the dispersal of these populations throughout urban neighbourhoods means that First Nations and Métis are not contributing to their marginalization by creating areas of concentrated poverty. However, the gap in socioeconomic status between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Canadians is being eroded very slowly, and the former have that much farther to climb in the first place. As pointed out by Green and Peach, the failure of the federal government to recognize Aboriginal demands for self-government has exacerbated this population's disengagement from shared citizenship.

The last chapter in Section Two, and the subsequent section entitled "International Experiences" are concerned with issues of immigration, difference, and integration outside Canada. While they provide interesting and compelling analyses of the responses of New Zealand, the European Union, the United Kingdom and the United States, their relevance to the Canadian experience is, at best, tenuous. This gives rise to my main criticism of this volume: the way in which the chapters are presented. While I appreciate that the editors may have intended to initially provide a theoretical framework in the first section for the discussions presented in

the subsequent chapters, the final section of the volume speaks specifically to the issues raised by Kymlicka, yet is strangely disconnected as a result of the intervening sections. The editors, as well as the balance of contributors to section five, warn against applying the experiences of diversity management of other jurisdictions to Canada, but the reader will have ingested 162 pages of exactly that before reaching the last section of this volume.

The fifth, and final section, and the concluding chapter of this book are the most compelling. By reflecting back upon Kymlicka's paper, this section provides symmetry to his thesis, and reinforces the purpose of the volume. Through quantitative analyses and commentaries thereon, the chapters in this section demonstrate that the policies dedicated to engendering a sense of shared citizenship in immigrants to Canada have not been entirely successful, have had greater success with certain racial and ethnic groups than others, and do not necessarily have greater positive effect over time. In particular, Reitz and Banerjee demonstrate that the homogenization of race and ethnicity in multicultural discourse has buried the failure of these policies to address the marginalization of Blacks. On the other hand, their statistical analyses reveal that economic success amongst immigrants is not necessarily correlated with social integration. Soroka, Johnston and Banting identify that the greatest disconnect between ethnic identity and social integration rests with two of Canada's founding populations: French Canadians and Aboriginals. Eliadis's paper provides a compelling argument that supports an emphasis on equality, rather than multiculturalism, to promote liberal values and encourage social integration and shared citizenship.

One concern with this book is the singling out of Islam to illustrate the experiences of faith-based communities in Canada. All three chapters in the fourth section are concerned with the Canadian response to Islam, thereby silencing the voices of other faith-based communities. I assume that the editors are attempting to respond to current socio-political concerns, but in so doing they fail to have regard for the long-standing marginalization of faith-based 'others' throughout Canada's history.

Finally, markedly absent from the volume is a paper dedicated to a feminist-based critical analysis of the pursuit of multiculturalism and the privileging of cultural practices that may be construed as oppressive to women. This omission reflects the dearth of similar analyses throughout current feminist discourse.

Belonging? Diversity, Recognition and Shared Citizenship in Canada is an important addition to social policy literature dealing with immigration, multiculturalism and social integration, and would be of particular interest to both students and academics involved in those areas. I found most of the chapters both compelling and useful in informing my undergraduate lectures on difference. Although the 682 pages proved to be hard slogging at times, I certainly felt better informed for having read them, and would have no hesitation in recommending this book.